Historicism Theory and Methodology

For assessing the causes of violence on North Western Frontiers of Pakistan

By. Aamir Mushtaq Cheema

Theory and hypothesis are Greek legacy and were meant for philosophical interpretation of the events, acts, causes and prediction. Presently both terms are used in science also thus the overlapping of understanding. In science the hypothesis and theories, are represented in mathematical language; they form the foundation of laws. Classically, in philosophy the hypothesis are not presented in mathematical figures , resultantly there are no theories in philosophy which can be written in same manner as in science.

Humans are unpredictable, their actions and reactions are dependent upon variables like geography, history and biology. Repetitions of events creates hypothesis, history forms the logical basis of human behaviour and its interpretation. Observation is the very basis of our sciences and philosophy, it was falling of apple , observed by Issac Newton, that gave birth to our gravitational laws. In true scientific sense, a law is a reality which remains unaffected by the environment. Thus laws of motion and gravity. However even the law of gravity have variation, leave with the fruit from same tree in majority of cases will not fall with same rate, as aerodynamics will not only retard the fall of leave but in many instances, it will take it higher than the point of drop as well. Leaf instead of falling , soaring lead to the formation of 'Theory of Flight'. Yet there are no laws of flying, because the theory is dependent upon variables of lift and weight. L= ½ rv2scl. [1] Thus lift is dependent upon velocity and pressure of air mass. It highlights that a theory is by itself dependent upon variables. Whereas the direction of wind is controlled in a research model, it cannot be predicted at Siachen glacier at 18000 feet.

The conventional scientific wisdom rests upon the notion that researcher does not begin a piece of research without first defining the problem and one or more hypothesis to be tested, often done on the basis of previous scientific studies and theories. Such research is termed s priori research. Thus, questionnaires fall into the category of priori research h as questions are formed before the data collection. Thus, the main emphasis is to test a number of hypothesis or theoretical notions specified at the outset of research. Alternatively, as Glaser and Strauss point out the emphasis of qualitative research is with discovery of substantive theory. Participant observation is normally not guided by an a priori development of hypothesis, concepts and measurement procedures.

[1] http://web.mit.edu/16.00/www/aec/flight.html

The same procedure may be defined as Inductive and Deductive modes of inquiry. An Inductive approach is the one in which the acquisition of knowledge or the process of research work out from actual data to the development of theoretical models, thus theoretical statements are built out of the data that the researcher has collected. A Deductive approach on the other hand begins with broad abstract theoretical statements generated independently of the data, these interrelated statement propositions are then tested by acquiring data to see if the data fit the theoretical propositions. (p-16) Thus, Charles Darwin employed an Inductive approach and Newton followed a deductive approach. In a deductive approach the function of data is to verify the researchers' theory.

Historicism as Theory

History[2] is the science of the past[3]. There are two main school of thoughts prevailing in the world,[4] those who believe in the laws of physics and its applicability in all fields are termed as Naturalistic or positive. [5]. Those who believe that its not possible to apply in totality these laws on human behaviour are known as or labelled as Anti Naturalistic or negative. I am following the anti-naturalistic philosophy. Thus whereas the flight path of a bullet fired from a rifle can be predicted with accuracy all over the world, the behaviour of the firer can only be hypothesised . it was Emperor Akbar[6] who can be rightly called as father of modern sociology. His research methodology in determining whether a child is inborn with language or it is adopted with the environment is a classic, something which cannot be repeated in modern era, he had over 100 new-born babies confined in a palace with none to talk but only to look after, after a year and half when Emperor Akbar visited toddlers again, he found that they are unable to speak any language

'History is also a theory'. Karl Raymond Popper[7] coins the term Historicism[8], as an approach to the social science which assumes that 'Historical Prediction' is their principal aim

---

[2] George Wilhelm Hegel *The Philosophy of History* Great books Of Western World, Robert Maynard Hutchins editor, London, Encyclopaedia Britannica, 1952., Peter T Mancs *A History & Philosophy of The Social sciences*, 1987, Basil Blackwell, Oxford. P-62.

[3]Marc Bloch *The Historian Craft,* translated. Peter Putnam.{NewYork: Alfred Knopf,1963}.

[4] Karl R Popper *Poverty of Historicism* Boston, Beacon Press, 1957. The fundamental debate which Popper stated, is that there can be no laws prediction of human of the course of human history by scientific or any other rational method. The paper was first read in January 1936 and Popper dedicated his book 'to the countless men and women of all creed or nation or races who felt victims to the fascist and communist belief in inexorable laws of historical destiny'. Popper argues in his book in a logical manner first putting the logic and doctrine and arguments of those historians who believe that history can also have laws like the physics and later in the book Popper gives the other side arguments, that there can be no laws applicable in history as in physics. Popper in his introduction to the book , p-5.

[5] Karl Jaspers, *The Origins and Goal of History* ,{NewHaven: Yale University,1953}

[6] A good work is *Darbar I Akbari*, history of Akbar the Great translated from Persian by Moulana Muhammad Azad, First edition 1910.

[7] Popper wrote much influenced *The Poverty of Historicism* {London,Routledge,1957}.W. A. Suchting (1972) 'Marx, popper, and 'historicism', *Inquiry: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Philosophy*, 15:1-4, 235-266, DOI:10.1080/00201747208601662. Bertrand Russell *Human Knowledge its scope and limits*, {George Allen and Unwin, New York},1966,p-9.

and this can be attained by discovering the rhythm, pattern, laws, or trends that underline the evolution of society. The debate is that whether history can bring predictions like physical sciences.

All social groups have their own traditions, their own institutions their own rites. Historicism claims that we must study the history of the groups, its traditions and institutions, if, we wish to understand and perhaps to foresee, its future development . We must try to understand intuitively the history of the various social groups, it is the doctrine. Popper highlights that it is important for the social scientist to understand the larger aspect of the action, such as raising of new army in a certain country, it is necessary to analyse the intentions, interest and so forth . Essence or the real character of a social group can reveal itself and be known, only through its history .

Collingwood stated that 'every historian would agree, I think that history is a kind of research or enquiry' . Collingwood's own idea of philosophy of history is a 'philosophical inquiry into the nature of history' history is a kind of research or inquiry , science is finding things out and in that sense history is a science, object of history is to 'action of human beings that have been done in the past'. The philosophy of history therefore is the study of historical thinking, not only the psychological analysis of its actual procedure but the analysis of the ideal which it sets before itself[9]

Karl Marx the very man whose writing and ideas ignited a chain of violence in last century was a firm believer of history, but to him history was a struggle of classes[10].Karl asserted that historical events have natural cause, he stated while writing about the events of French coup of 1851, ' Hegel remarks somewhere that all facts and personages of great importance in world history occur as it were twice. He forgot to add; the first time as tragedy second as farce' Philosophy is thinking about the world as a whole, to study the nature of selected parts of the world is to be scientist; to study its nature as a whole is to be philosopher.[11] In science, theory is supported by general laws, however in history, there are no general laws. There are exceptions, as Arnold Toynbee's theory of civilisation 'which broadly consist of numerous hypothesis and generalisation.[12].

---

[8] Historicism, the analysis and explanations of various differences between the various sociological doctrines and schools

[9] Richard Collingwood is regarded as an influential historian, his work *Idea of History*{Oxford,1956} is primarily comprised of his lectures delivered in 1936. Also see Collingwood Richard 'The Nature and aim of a Philosophy of History' first published in 1924-1925 in *Essays in the Philosophy of History* {University of Texas:1967},p.36. Dray William, *History as Re-Enactment R.G. Collingwood's idea of history*. Oxford University , 1995.P-32.Another major work on History is by Vico{1668-1744} who gave it the name of ' New Science'.

[10] 'The history of all hitherto existing societies is the history of class struggle' are the opening sentences of his much famed work *Communist Manifesto* in 1848.

[11] Ibid*, the Philosophy of History* , leaflet of historical Association No.79, {1930}

[12] Arnold Jhonson,. *The Historian and historical Evidence*{NewYork: Charles Scribner 1926},p.33

Historical inquiry does not strictly bind itself to the scientific model of investigation, historian is in most instances searching for the unique and particular case, not for the general and universally applicable principle or law. His goal is less to verify or refute a hypothesis and more to reconstruct the past as accurately as possible .[13] The goal of the observer is to link the observed facts with more general statements and to reduce the number of general statements to a system of the fewest numbers of the statements sufficient to account for the phenomena with which one is concerned.[14]. Auguste Comte presented direct observation experimentations and comparison as the specific observational methods, he cautioned direct observers to apply a specific theoretical viewpoint, test their results to vague and incoherent…research might focus on occurrences as social customs, forms of languages and collectively erected monuments.[15]

Behaviour of the humans is determined by their identity which itself is shaped by the society's values, history, practices and institutions, Constructivism holds that all institutions including the state are socially constructed, thus constructivism is a theory based upon observations and scientific study, Every scholar has a basic and fundamental concept about the event to which he is inquisitive, years of study, observation and conversation has established the parameters. Religion and economics emerged as two major causes of the human conflict. Politics is used to describe the events and causes which does not fall under the previous two, thus it is abstract in nature.

Logic is the art of reasoning, it is something which is abstract and mind accepts it a priori, as 'all man are mortal, Socrates is a man so Socrates is mortal'[16] or putting it mathematically, if A = B, and B= C, then A=C. Logic is strongly based upon the history, which a child has built up from his inception, thus for man brought up in North Waziristan and other in London, the killing of lover over adultery will have different logical outputs. Our computing system is based upon Logic and this is the major drawback of sociology based upon computing logic, as in it the cultural values which so strongly affects the logic does not play the decisive factor. However mere personal observations are not enough to establish a guideline where actions and behaviour of other can be predicted, man has learnt the behaviour of other men through observations and personal experience .

Sociology[17] deals with the humans and social research is the interaction between the ideas and evidence. American Sociological Association was created in 1865 with an aim ' to guide the public mind to the best possible means of promoting the amendments of law,

---

[13] Arnold . *The Historian and historical Evidence* .,pp-31-33.
[14] Peter T Mancs *A History & Philosophy of The Social Sciences*, 1987, Basil Blackwell, Oxford. P-62
[15] P-63, ibid.
[16] For detail , see *Aristotle Complete Works*,
[17] Sociology can be classified as general and special sociology, in general sociology includes biology and psychology, in special sociology, there are three sub division known as pure, applied and empirical sociology, for more see, Ferdinand Toennies, *On Sociology: Pure, Applied and Empirical, selected writings* , ed Werner Cahman and Rudolph Heberle { University of Chicago, 1961. Sociology first appeared in in English in 1842 , it was used by Auguste Comte a French in 1830.

advancement of education, prevention and repression of crimes and reformation of criminals', initially every college sociology lectures were given by the Protestant ministers.[18]In 1893 department of sociology was formed in University of Chicago and in 1894, the first graduate department in sociology was created in Columbia University , similarly in 1895 the first professional journal was published. It gave rise to early survey movement by Paul Young emphasising on the wages and family. In 1912, Russel Sage foundation created a department of survey and information, by 1928 this department has carried out 2000 surveys. In 1923, a social science research council(SSRC) was established, its main emphasis was on the methods. The first publication was in 1931 by Stuart Rice on Methods in social science, all in all 52 contributors emphasized on the methodology. One of the major study was on Polish Peasant , a review was carried by Herbert Blumer, the main emphasis was 'whether the diaries and letters on which Polish Peasant was based adequately supported the main conclusion of the study.[19] The SSRC thus coined the term 'personal document' through its bulletin to cover all qualitative material including open ended interviews.[20] Sampling procedures were first used in England before 1914, in USA it was employed mainly for market research, however it was the USA army which introduced tests during the WW1. In mid-thirties, the Gallup's institute of public opinion research and the journal Psychometric was formed. The first major books a 1500 page on recent social trends in USA was published. Another landmark research was carried out in1939-40 in USA by Princeton University on public opinion research, it was conducted by Hadley Contriff. After the Pearl harbour an increased interest was shown in content analysis, sampling surveys, detailed interviews and laboratory experiments and to understand group dynamics. It was Kurt Lewin a German who in 1938 had coined the term 'action research' and also the term Group Dynamics. In Germany, the notion of Handlung or human action was the centre of all social research studies. In fact, Kurt's student Alfred Marrow wrote the Practical Theories, Lewin later carried out an experiment in his student's factory to understand the individual attitude in terms of the factory output. He later wrote about the individual attitudes and decision-making under the influence of small groups. in 1948, the term applied sociology was used in very small conference in America, later another term social engineer was coined by Lazerfeld in Norway in same year, aim of both was to make at par this sociology with science.

Historical logic thus is nothing else but repetition of events, there was a great war in 1914-1918, followed by another in 1939-1945; thus logic says that there will be another war. It is only after analysing the causes which in any case are numerous that one can predict as why another war can take place or not. Karen Katajin highlights the *History and Repetition*[21], 'from ancient times it has been said that history repeats itself, in truth people study history precisely because it is not a onetime phenomenon but rather maintains the possibility of recurrence.?

---

[18] Paul Lazarsfeld, Jeffrey Reitz, *An Introduction to Applied Sociology* ,(NewYork: Elsevier,1975),p-1.
[19] Paul Lazerfeld, *An Introduction to Sociology,* p-3.
[20] Ibid.
[21] Kojin Karatini. *History and Repetition* ,ed. Seiji M.Lippit {NewYork: Columbia University,2012}.

Repetition in history does not signify the recurrence of the same event, for repetition is possible only in terms of form {structure} and not event {content}.

History is a generalised assessment of the personal actions of men united in bodies for any public purpose and science is the combination of a great mass of similar facts into the unity of a generalisation , a principle , or a certainty by the recurrence of like events under given conditions[22] . Lord Acton went on to states that ,*'there is no regularity in the throws of the dice taken ten and ten together, but in a ten thousand throws, we can predict with great confidence how many times sixes will be drawn, there is no possible certainty that any given individual will commit murder , but take a population of one hundred thousand and in a given time someone or the other is sure to be found committing murder'*.

Methodology

History is never constructed from narratives but from documents[1] , it is one view and other is that history can be constructed rather it is present irrespective of the documents. By history I mean research conducted scientifically.[2]The methodology that I have adopted is to be Inductive, rather than Deductive, to have qualitative approach instead of being quantitative. To rely upon the historicism as a theory in order to have a logical conclusion. Empirical in nature with field work. Inductive method in the context of this research, means to enter into the Frontier and North Waziristan with no hypothesis to validate, on the contrary the events themselves are bound to create the hypothesis.

Positivism[23] is the scientific method which ensure scientific experimentation capable of providing knowledge about cause-effect –relationship. Positivism is a commitment to determinism , it also requires empiricism. '*So that he (researcher) must consequently be on his guard against first impressions indeed our main objective is to extend the scope of scientific rationalism to cover human behaviour by demonstrating that in light of the past, it is capable of being reduced relationship of cause and effect… what has been termed as our positivism is merely a consequence of this rationalism.'.*[24]

Civilisations are not only in geographical sense but also in philosophical manner too. At present, in any civilisation, there exists multiple civilisations, in terms of urban, rural, modern, industrial, agricultural, liberal, conservative, militant, open, close; to name few. For

---

[22] Lord Edward Acton, Review on the Thesis of Mr Buckle's History of Civilisation in England first published in *Rambler*1858 , *Essays in the Liberal Interpretation of History*, ed. William McNeill. {Chicago: University Press,1967}.

[23] Auguste Comte{1798-1857} ,used the term Positivism, Few other famous Positivists are Rene Descartes {1596-1650} Issac Newton {1642-1727}, Voltaire {1694-1778}, Rousseau {1712-1778} he wrote Social Contract {1762}, Kant {1724-1801} he asked ' What is enlightenment? And Ibn Khaldun {1337-1406},

Durkheim *The Rules of Sociological Method and selected Texts on Sociology and its Method* , edited Steven Lukes, Translated W.D.Halls . London, Macmillian, 1982.[24] P-31, written in preface

generation of data, I have relied upon narrative rather than exclusive mathematical figures. The mere figures can be gained and gathered from the census reports which itself dates back to 1891. However the figures have limitation as they create a scientific web of logic, but lacks the interpretation. Thus in 1998 census, North Waziristan have the highest number of mud house among the frontier agencies. One interpretation is to label it as the most under develop, poor, void of modernisation, because this is what the figures highlight. On the contrary, mud house are the most natural habitat which provided cool environment and above all is the best defence against the artillery, tanks and small arms fire. Therefore mere figures without empirical interpretation are misleading.

A case study is defined as in-depth multi-faceted investigation using qualitative research methods, definition is intentionally broad. Case study can be that of an organisation, a city, it can be even be an entire group of people. There are several types of qualitative research that have been termed as case studies, including ethnography or field research. Social history of a social group also qualifies as case studies when they are conducted on the past experiences of a group. Similarities between the civil wars and revolutions also fall under case study. Case studies invoke no more general properties than those supplied by its own data. Case studies method receives only limited attention in current textbooks on social research.[25]

Grounded Theory[26]

Chicago tradition is associated with down to earth qualitative research, Barney Glasser and Anselm L Strauss highlighted that in post war sociology there is a gap between theory and empirical research; an embarrassing gap. They wrote that not everyone can equally skilled at discovering theory but neither do they need to be genius to generate useful theory, we believe that the discovery of theory from data which we call grounded theory. Their main point was that previous books on methods of social research have focussed on how to verify theories. The job of theory to them was, to enable prediction and explanation of behaviour, to be useful in theoretical advance in sociology and finally to provide a perspective on behaviour.[27] Herbert Blumer stated that the aim of theory in empirical science is to develop analytical schemes, this is done by conceiving the world abstractly, that is in terms of objects and of relations between such classes.[28]

Grounded Theory gains a reputation and reverence among researchers, as it allows them the freedom of carrying out a research without any preconceived biases. The theory itself owes its origin to the two researchers namely Barney Glaser and Andrew Strauss who conducted research on a nursing

---

[25] Joe R.Feagin, Anthony M.Drum, Gideon Syoberg *A case for case study* (University of North Carolina,1991),pp.1-27.
[26] Barney G.Glasser, ed, *Grounded Theory 1984-1994, volume 1 and 2* (Sociology Press, California,1995)
[27] Barney G.Glasser , Anselm L.Strauss *The Discovery of Grounded Theory strategies for qualitative research* (Chicago,Aldine,1967).
[28] Herbert Blumer, 'What is wrong with Social Theory', in William Filstead,ed, *Qualitative Methodology: first hand investigation with the social world* (Chicago: Markham, 1970),p-52.

home and later wrote The Discovery of Grounded Theory (Chicago, 1967). Over a period of time the Grounded Theory became so popular and debatable that Glaser had to write and edit it in 1995 as Grounded Theory 1984-1994. He wrote 'I can create grounded theory methodology, I can write grounded theory and I can teach grounded theory but I cannot control how grounded theory methodology is used. It is a high impact methodology changing the perspectives of many researchers and beginning to change the approach and perspective of many disciplines. Grounded theory is a 'free at last' approach to preconceived methods

Grounded theory stands on its own as a theory of method which yields a full range of methodological techniques from entering the field of data collection to final writing. It is just another methodology, researcher should choose what is the best method for the problem in hand.

Glasser further wrote, I have discovered that there are very few teachers of grounded theory, researchers perforce have, get together, read books and teach each other. Glasser favours an open mindedness in research, 'my goal in writing grounded theory methodology was and is to empower researchers with an open, generative, emergent methodology…goal was not to tell them what to find or how to force it out of the data but to do research that allows the emergence of 'what is going on'. In the end Glasser the founder of the theory states that 'grounded theory is merely a methodological option…it is what it is and works with any data as all is data for generating'. The term 'all is data' means leaving time and place behind., so the researcher can go anywhere to find any form of data. The main point is that a researcher should enter the field with no preconceived interests. The researchers who have used this theory in methodology highlights, 'hypothesis gleaned either from data or from literature review or a combination of both…I think the strongest case for the use of grounded theory is in investigating of relatively unchartered waters or to gain fresh perspective in a familiar situation'.[29]

Memoing is a method of preserving emerging hypothesis, analytical schemes, hunches and abstractions. They are sparked by the data and in this way, they are grounded. Ideas for analysis occur at uneven pace and at unlikely hours, these ideas are captured first on scraps of paper, later on typewritten pages or cards.[30] Similarly the production of the research report differs from the more familiar reports of quantitative studies, in it, they differ by employing literature, absence of numerical data and use of field notes. Thus, in place of numbers concepts are supported in the report by examples from field data. Collection of data in grounded theory is also empirical in nature, it may be collected from interviews, observations or documents or a combination of these sources, for example in a study on stepfather, the data was gleaned from telephone calls and letters. [31]

To find an answer to the questions, the field work was carried out and data was searched. Scouts are very possessive of their personal lives, seldom anyone will ever remarks about even the number of his sisters , or the name of his wife , thus such kind of questions can neither be asked through a questionnaire nor through any interview, but over a period of time , in a

---

[29] Phyliss Noerager Stern *Grounded Theory Methodology: Its uses and processes.* First published Image February 1980,vol 12. Barney G.Glasser, ed, Grounded Theory 1984-1994, volume 1 and 2 (Sociology Press, California,1995),pp.29-33.

[30] Ibid, Phyliss Noerager Grounded theory.

[31] Phyliss Noergaer carried out a study on the stepfather families in 1976, with an aim to know how a stepfather is integrated into the existing family.

conversation , these things or matter can be inquired. Official documents are the best and most authentic way to formulate a data base of such social patterns. It may come as surprise but in every militia outfit, every tribesman has to fill in no less than twenty odd forms , ranging from his next of kin to the distribution of his gratuity in case of death between his wife and parents, overwhelmingly it is mother who is nominated, not the father or wife. I adopted the method of 'writing history' and it was fact , thus the scouts came voluntarily to narrate their tales and stories and to enlighten me about their way of life. The advantage of doing this in the Militia is the number of men available to narrate it and the variety in them. In North Waziristan, had I been conducting this research outside the militia outfit, the interaction with tribes would have been minimum, either Wazir or Daur but within the Militia there are over eleven such tribes and thus it becomes statistically more reliable to have narration from such a wide group. My observation on Militia is that, they love and like to speak about themselves, only if it is being taken as history.

Field Study[32]

'An investigator is never able to shake off entirely his role of outsider and I am in accord with those who maintain that it is not advisable for him to do so, some exceptionally valuable information comes to the outsider simply because he is one'. [33]

Fieldwork is a method of gathering in-depth data about the meaning of structure, moral codes and social behaviour of particular cultural groups or the individual who compose their membership. [34]

The experiences of field workers have not been systematically reported and as a result a whole area of methodological skills- the human relations skills which go with the social researcher's role has remained relatively uncodified.

In another article named as Getting Individuals to give information to the outsiders by Fred H.Blum (p-83). It highlights the experience gained at George Hormel Company at Austin in 1948, it was a two years field work aiming at understanding the relationship of workers with the industrial and social process.

Participant Observation

Phenomenology and participant Observation were termed as the new empiricists , whereas phenomenology is regarded as an European tradition the participation observation is more an American

[32] William J.Filstead ed, Qualitative Methodology: Firsthand involvement with the social world. (Chicago,Markham,1971).H.M.Trice The Outsider role in field study, Sociology and social research 1941,pp 27-32.
[33] H.M.Trice The Outsider role in field study, Sociology and social research 1941,pp 27-32.
[34] Jennifer Hunt, *Psychoanalytic aspects of field work qualitative research methods* (London: Sage,1989),p-11.

way of research but fundamentally both stress of going into research with an open mind, without any preconceived hypothesis ' they are creating new procedures and perspectives in the study of man in society, that breaks fundamentally with those of the older school of scientific empiricism'.[35]

Another study was carried on the **participant observation** as employed in the study of a military training program[36]. The aim of the study was to gain an insight into the motivation and attitudes of personnel in training, with a view to reduce the incidences of discipline. Thus, a researcher was enlisted as a basic trainee, his real identity was kept as secret to the group, 'there were literally thousands of problems to overcome, not only in deciding how the study would be conducted but also in determining how the participant-observer would be guided in his work, the things to be looked for or recorded if observed, the form reports should take and how the data would be used after the study was completed'. Some of the findings are interesting as they are pertinent today. For instance, the trainees initially look towards their instructors for leadership but slowly they learnt to make short cuts and realise that certain things are never checked by the instructors. During the research, the trainees were given questionnaires four times, having thirty-seven questions to reflect the subject's attitudes towards aspects of their training.

In drawing a comparison between the participant observation and interviewing, the researchers highlight that by participant observation they mean, the method in which the observer participates in the daily life of the people under study, either openly in the role of researcher or covertly in some disguised role. Observing things that happen, listening to what is said and questioning people, over some length of time.[37] Both Becker and Geer highlighted the knowledge gained from two methods, in their opinion as long as the interviewer is explaining or sharing the experience which he saw himself the value of interview is as good as the participant observation but when the researcher tends to gather knowledge from a person through an interview in which he was not present than its value diminished.

Both researchers later highlighted the loss of data when any other method is employed in gathering of data other than the participant observation. Later Howard Becker further delved upon the methodology by highlighting the problem of inference and proof.[38] '*sociologist usually use this method when they are especially interested in understanding a particular organisation or substantive problem rather than demonstrating relation between abstractly defined variables, they attempt to make their research theoretically meaningful but they assume that they do not know enough about the organisation a priori to identify relevant problems and hypothesis and that they must discover these in the course of the research*'.[39] (He went on to highlight his own research experience on medical students in Kansas where

---

[35] Severyn T.Bruyn The New Empiricists: The participant observer and phenomenologist. *Sociology and social research,*51: 317-22, also see Severyn Bruyn *The human Perspective in Sociology* (NewYork:Prentice-Hall,1966).
[36] William J.Filstead ed, Qualitative Methodology: Firsthand involvement with the social world. (Chicago,Markham,1971),pp.91-99.Mortimer Sullivan, Stuart Queen, Ralph Patrick. Participant Observation as employed in the study of a military training program, *American Sociological Review*,23,660-67.
[37] Howard Becker , Blanche Geer 'participant observation and interviewing: a comparison' was originally published in ' Human Organisation',16: 28-32 and included in William J.Filstead ed, *Qualitative Methodology: First hand involvement with the social world.* (Chicago,Markham,1971),pp.133-145. The study by Becker and Geer was regarding the medical students.
[38] Howard Becker 'Problem of Inference and proof in participant observation,' *The American Sociological Review*,23: 652-60.
[39] Ibid.

no less than 5000 single spaced pages were gathered). To him, observational research produces an immense amount of detailed description, the problem starts as how to interpret the data which is not only rich but varied, its analysation in systematically manner and its conclusion so as to convince other scientist of its validity.

The three distinct stages of analysis conducted in the field itself. First and foremost is the selection and definition of problem, concepts and indices, second is the check on the frequency and distribution of phenomena and the incorporation of individual findings into a model. The fourth stage of final analysis involves problem of presentation of evidence and proof.

Selection and definition of problems, concepts and indices

In this stage which is the first stage in field, the observer looks for problems and concepts that give promise of yielding the greatest understanding of the organisation he is studying, the typical conclusion that his data yields are the simple one that a given phenomenon exists, that a certain event occurred once or that two phenomena were observed to be related in one instance, the conclusion says anything about the frequency or distribution off observed phenomenon.

By placing such observation in the context of social theory the observer selects concepts and defines problems. For instance, in Frontier Corps the word Qaum and Watan is used and I heard it, as being 'he belongs to my qaum and he belongs to other qaum, he is my handiwal'. Thus, these terms have to be defined and theorised. 'occupants of one social category in an institution classify members of other categories by criteria derived by the ethnicity of other person'. [40]Thus, the observed fact and theory directs him(researcher) to see the organisation in terms of qualmm. By further questioning and continued observation, researcher may develop specific hypothesis about the nature of these men; as I formed a hypothesis of these Pathans being a racist people and among them the wazir considering himself as superior to the Daur.

Use of indicator is important and needs bit of classification. Becker highlights that conclusion about single event also lead the observer to decide on specific item which might be used as indicators of less easily observed phenomenon. Thus, in his case the medical student complaining about the degree of work, that he has to work on weekends to lead the Becker to use complaint about the weekend work as an indicator of student perspective on the amount of work he has to do. Observer may become aware of some very specific phenomenon first and later see that may be used as an indicator of some larger class of problem or he may have the larger problem in mind and search for specific indicators to use in studying it.

Credibility of informants. Many items of evidence given by the statements of the group cannot be taken t face value and neither to be brushed aside as valueless. The method of historian in examining of personal documents have to be employed, thus informants background, whether he have a reason to lie or conceal some of what he has seen as truth. Does vanity or expediency lead him to misstate his own role in an event or his attitude towards it? did he actually have an opportunity to witness the occurrence he describes or is it hearsay. The sociological proposition is that an individual's statement and description of events are made from a perspective which is a function of his position in the group.[41]

---

[40] . Ibid,

[41] Howard Becker, *Problems of inference and proof.*

The Methods of Field Studies

The two methods usually thought of as characteristics of the investigator in the field, he invariably keeps a daily log of events and of relatively casual informal continuous interviews. Almost invariably he also develops informants, that is selected members who are willing and able to give information about practices and rules in the organisation. The three methods of field research which is taken as primary are First. Participant-observation, in this field observer directly observes and also participates , in a sense that he ahs durable social relations in the oragnisation. Second is Informant-Interviewing; in it the informant is passing on the information about the events in which he is not a participant, he is reporting about others and not about himself, his information about events in their absensce. The third method is Enumeartion and samples. In this the surveys and direct and indirect, repeated, countable observation.[42]

Constructing questions[43]

Theory of question wording has not been as far advanced as one might wish, asking question is widely accepted as a cost efficient and some time as the only way of gathering information about past behaviour and experience. In 1940-41, 25% of the 85 empirical studies depended upon interviews and questionnaires, in 1965-66, it was 48% and in 1967-68, 64 % of 136 research papers were based upon verbal reports.[44] However there are certain limitations in this methodology, for instance in 1951, in a random sample of 900 Denver residents, 17% gave incorrect answer regarding their age, which differ from 1-3 years. In another hallmark study, La Pierre in 1934-35, spend some time travelling in USA with a Chinese couple, they stayed at 66 hotels/motels and 184 restaurants where they wanted to eat, only one establishment refused them to serve. Six months later, La Pierre wrote to all these establishment asking whether they will accept Chinese are as guests, only 50% replied and among them 90% said no. Thus the major finding of the study was that the people differ in what they say on paper and what they do in reality.[45] Thus the very act of gathering information through mere questions is a highly risky affair. The Phenomenological or subjectivist point of view which is accepted by a wide range of researchers, follows collection of data through a prolonged intimate immersion in the social interaction in question or the use of non-directive, open questions that respondent answer in their own words rather than in terms of pre-set response categories. This method consists of interacting with the native members as much as possible until their way of life has been absorbed. competence is indicated when the new member can act in new situation with confidence and without making mistakes.[46] Irwin Deutscher remarked, our scientific conclusion for the most part is based upon analysis of verbal responses to the questions put by an interviewer thus responses may be written or oral and the questions may range from forced choice to open

---

[42] Morris Zelditch 'Some Methodological Problems of Field Studies', *American Journal of Sociology*, 67: 566-76.
[43] William Foddy , *Constructing questions for interview and questionnaires, theory and practice in social research* (Cambridge: 1993).
[44] William Foddy , *Constructing questions for interview and questionnaires, theory and practice in social research* (Cambridge: 1993),p.2.
[45] Ibid,p-3.
[46] H.M Collins ,' Meaning of lies, accounts of action and participatory researcher' in G.M.Gilbert and P.Abdul,eds. *Survey conference on Sociological Theory and Method*. (Aldershot: Gower),p-15.

ended, but the fact remains that we obtain from such methods are mere statements of attitude, opinion, norms, values, anticipation or recall.[47]

Symbolic Interactionist Theory, the term was coined sociologist Herbert Blumer, 'social actors in any social situation are constantly negotiating a shared definition of the situation, taking one another viewpoint into accounts.[48]

Concepts and Coding.

Condensing the bulk of our data sets into analysable units by creating categories with and from data is known as coding, it is part of process of analysis and not the analysis itself. The data analysis comprises of, data reduction, data display and conclusion. There is no single right or most appropriate way of analysing qualitative data. Coding can be thought of as a range of approaches, that aid the organisation, rechecking and interpretation of the data.[49]

Interviewing

The establishment of a god human contact with the person from one intends to draw the social information is vital and was highlighted by Fred Blumer 'the interviewer-conversation as developed in this project is rather a unique combination of interviewing and exchanging information.[50]

School Children, in Tochi Scouts, and also in Chitral Scouts, Khyber Rifles and Kurram Militia, there are primary and elementary schools being run by these militia outfits. I , through the principals announced cash awards for best essays, and received over sixty essays in each outfit from boys and girls, depicting their social life, life in their village, the rites and rituals, the games they play. Their favourite sports, programmes, relatives. In the end a new data base has been made basing upon the narrations of these children. How many have television in their homes and how many are allowed to watch them , how their families spend times , how many are living with their grandparents, how many of their relatives have been killed in the war. This data decoding does not require any special pattern but each and every essay has to be read and then relative points noted . Painting competition was conducted, in which the children depicted their village and other scenery, poems were another way of knowing the social realities of the area. What the children wrote was in most of the cases correlated with the school data of the children.

---

[47] Irwin Deutscher 'Words and deeds social science and social policy', in William Filstead,ed. *Qualitative methodology: First hand involvement with the social world* (Chicago: Markham,1970),p-27.
[48] William Foddy , *Constructing questions for interview and questionnaires, theory and practice in social research* (Cambridge: 1993),p.21.
[49] Amanda Coffey, Paul Atkinson, *Making Sense of qualitative data, complementary research strategies* (London: Sage,1996),pp.6-27.
[50] Fred Blumer 'getting individuals to give information to the outsider ' in William Filstead,ed. *Qualitative methodology: First hand involvement with the social world* (Chicago: Markham,1970). Fred Blum carried out a research in 1948 at Austin Minnesota in a George Hormel packaging company.

Similarly, the new recruits were also put through this exercise of writing essays about their life, their ambitions, their likes and dislikes. Recruits response is better because they are already undergoing training and as such in the study period they complied it, when I tried it with soldiers, the result was poor as almost invariably all soldiers were committed around the clock on duties with little time to write

Hospital Record. Hospitals are in every scout corps , their records are maintained religiously and in a systematically pattern. I searched and was given all the required data, about the number of admissions, the type of diseases most common among the scouts, the physical chart of every tribe and that becomes handy in comparing the physical standards among various tribes. The scouts families are also residing within the camp, to some limit. These are also dependent upon the same hospital, although a lady doctor comes once in a fortnight but the record is also kept, and this data of female anatomy is also helpful, how many children they have, when they got married, instances of miscarriage, relationship between them and mother in law. By collecting the data from four militia corps deployed along the Durand Line, is a new addition to the knowledge.

Interview. In the majority of the research work, interview is constructed, in which the questions are asked and the answers are taken and then codified and decodified. In case of *War Comes to Li Ann,* there were over 70 hours of interviews spreading over 1000 pages of data. But every region is different from other and to impose a study and research pattern as a standard system , is not workable in the North Waziristan and even in other tribal agencies specially with the war going on. I can recollect that in the morning while sitting in the library of Tochi Scouts waiting for Sepoy Gul Khan Wazir to come and narrate the events of his training, I learnt that two scouts have died just now due to firing at the gate, thus the whole momentum of research is not only halted but taken back. Therefore the most important aspect to be kept in mind in research is to be mindful of the situation that is taking place and to have patience; only then the scouts and militia will develop the trust and that takes time.

Observation . Nothing is more interesting and fruitful than observing humans engaged in a particular work From observation , so many data channels can be drawn, take example , in Harrisonburg Virginia, one can sit in the James Madison University and can observe the students ,as how many are wearing leather shoes, or how many girls have tucked their jeans inside their long boots, or how many people in a given hour passes through this corridor , and from these various kind of hypothesis can be constructed, for instance, it is only girls who wears long boots , and from this a theory can be constructed. In North Waziristan, such luxury is not available to observe human as the mere observation can bring in a volley of fire from the Taliban or from military. Thus it is the militia within the confines of the fort which provides an observation data , basing purely on own observation. It looks odd to take notes , but at times I have been noting the ‘live observation’ the movement of troops, the particular colour they prefer to wear, they invariably all love to pour or spray themselves with body spray in the evening, a habit which I

found almost non-existent among the army soldiers residing and living under the same environment drawing the same pay. Absence of any female posters in their living bunkers is another glaring omission from the stereotype personality of soldiers depicted and almost engraved in everybody's brain. I observed them keenly very keenly, I noticed that they wear white socks as part of their uniform in chappals and I not even once noticed a dirty pair of socks not even of off white colour, the elastic was always firm never hanging on toes. I saw their chappals polished, their belt for a change is not always very tight especially among elder scouts.

I kept a journal of the research, in which almost at everyday all the observations of the day were noted, the journal was kept updated and written both on paper and on computer, I kept it informal. There was a fear of falling all the data in the hands of the insurgents or to the intelligence agencies, thus majority of notes and other readings were coded and written after coming back from the research area. I have met over thousand scouts, had cup of tea with them, listen to their stories. Over all they are simple in nature, obedient, introvert, conservative, religious and above all professional in every sense. They look after their equipment, everything which is under their charge. I recall how the education platoon was after me because one ordinary magazine was missing from the library. Razif Afridi (Hassu Khel fame) came to me almost two weeks after narrating his episode, he was bit worried about his account ' you see I have to live here for another ten years, I hope you will not write anything bad about my account, it will be bad for my Qaum'. Every night I had a chat with sentry on Mess Guard, they all were from different Qaum and I found all of them good , thus particular tribe have certain distinct characteristics than others.

Research Model

A research model is basically a condensed form of actual . Emperor Akbar was able to refute the hypothesis that every child has an inborn quality to speak the mother tongue[51], by confining the 300 odd new born in a palace. In terms of this research, the seven political agencies of FATA are the core, among them North Waziristan has been selected mainly due to its history of violence. In a research model, the variables should remain constant for a given period. In sociology it is not possible, as every new generation is different from the past by virtue of the modern advancement in technology. Thus, in 2000 the tribes are different from 1900, as there was no aircraft or mobile then, and both have changed the way of life.

In order to predict about the future events in North Waziristan Agency, Historicism has to be ascertained empirically and then taking year 1895 as the start point, because it was in this year that the levies were raised. North Waziristan Militia presently known as Tochi Scouts provides the Research Model. Its present strength of 3150 men from eleven different tribes gives

[51] See literature review.

scientific data of figures in the field of health, wealth, discipline, mental prowess, sports, examination, and bravery. Its records are update and accessible; only at MiranShah. Around this data and personal observation including interviews with varying tribes, thereby gaining an access to their culture and philosophy. Fieldwork, Inductive, Logical Reasoning, Observation, and Intuition becomes the main tool in understanding the past and present. MiranShah acted as the cardinal thread in Research Model, it has changed very little since 1900, everyday life of militia, army and natives. Present events up till December 2012 are taken as the end point.

Variables are the factors which affects the outcome of a theory, in Theory of Flight, the wind, surface condition, temperature, viscosity all are variables. It is possible to minimise them or keep them as standard in a research model. In real life, in frontier it is not possible to have a same cycle of life for an individual year around. However in case of militia or a army unit, one can have a similarity of life for decades. Every morning there is a physical period , then drill, then breakfast, lunch at noon with specific menu, games in evening, duties at night, leave after a specified time and so on. This kind of regimental life is constant, the variables and every day changes are also constant.

On Frontier, we have tribes as one constant factor, although within the tribes there are variables of ethnicity. These tribes are not identical in nature, their outlook differs so is their ideology. Another identity in the FATA is the presence of Frontier Corps or the Militia which since the raising of these agencies in 1900 have been an integral part of the system along with the political agent. The third identity or variable is the army, which has been present in the area on irregular basis for varying time duration, ***thus tribes, militia and the army forms the triad in the FATA; it is the relationship among these three which is the subject of interest***

Limitation on Research in Tribal Areas

After 9/11 and especially after the army taking control of operations in July 2005, which lead to increase in army led operations in tribal areas; all those associated with army or military were seen with great suspicion by the natives, in many cases uniform personal were killed while on leave in their respective tribal areas or while being enroute. In order to understand the reasons for ongoing violence in North Waziristan and in other tribal areas of Pathans, the researcher cannot live with all segments of society or the tribe for many reasons, the chief being the security, followed by culture.[52] Unlike West, where any scholar from tribal areas will be culturally accommodated among the women and men in a pub or in a park, without raising of any eye brow, no such liberty is available in tribal areas of Pakistan. Even to get into the mindset of the men in North Waziristan, was and still is an uphill task, the suspicion of being a spy is in the back of the mind of both. There is public transport but it is highly risky as the many

[52] Evan Luard Edited, *The International Regulations of Frontier Dispute* {Thames, London, 1970} p-16.

instances of it being hijacked and only scholarly looking and government persons being slaughtered.[53] The other major limitation is the official stance, and mind set of the military where any word in favour of tribes is taken as a sympathiser of Taliban and hence an anti-state and anti-army person. Same holds true for highlighting American actions as favourable in the conflict; this is taken as a sign of being anti Islam among the tribes. Morality and ethics have to be kept in mind while carrying out research in tribal areas, as a researcher one spends time with the militia, army and natives and as such one comes across quite a confidential material which has to be analysed and presented without compromising the reputation of the individual and his tribe.

Lack of official records is another limitation, in 2002, bulk of records of Frontier Corps kept at Ministry of Interior in Islamabad were burnt in a fire accident, thus the records kept with the militia corps becomes vital. When I arrived at MiranShah, I was being taken as a suspicious kind of a person. Commandant[54] had invited me and as such he introduced me to the officers and later the subedar and other ranks, but for the ordinary scout, I was an enigma, am I an American agent, collecting data for some study, what is my aim, what is my purpose, these were few of the standards questions that were asked in the initial days. This air of suspicion is a reality and all are theoretical framework does not cater for such attitude. Passage of time is the only remedy, more one spends time with the natives by playing sports with them, taking long walks, listening to them even if they are irrelevant in nature, offering prayers with them in mosques, attending Muharram majlis, travelling with scouts in same convoys are few of the steps which ease the suspicion and opens up the tribes to talk about themselves and the current state of affairs.

Within the university, there are no original software and access to primary paid sources is limited, there is no student accommodation thus students have to make own arrangements. At ministerial level, there is no access to data in Ministry of Frontier Region and also in Ministry of Interiors. These ministries are cooperative but inherently they have no storage to data and files. At MiranShah, the political agent office have files, store in a heap without any numbering. They allow me to search through their stores but no copying was allowed neither taking of pictures of files was permitted; same holds true for militia and army headquarters at Peshawar, Rawalpindi and Miranshah.

Structure of Research

The whole thesis is a chronological statement, divided into four parts. Part one is the premise and includes introduction, literature review, theoretical, philosophical and methodology. In it the North Waziristan is taken as the case study and its militia acts as the research model.

[53] A summary of casualties suffered by Frontier Corps highlights that no less than 9% casualties have been suffered when the troops were on leave or while coming back from leave. Most affected were the Waziristan area.
[54] Colonel Wajahat Hamdani.

Part Two, 1895-1947, (chapters 4,5,) is the base of logic. Raising of Levies, their transition into Militia and finally as Scouts. The very first modern campaign on frontier against the Fakir of Ipi, why it failed to achieve the mission. The facts highlighted in it will be used as the arguments in the next part. We must try to understand intuitively the history of the various social groups. It is important for the social scientist to understand the larger aspect of the action, such as raising of new army in a certain country, it is necessary to analyse the intentions , interest and so forth, Inference by analogy . [55] Levies were the very first and model of militia which British raised on North Western Frontier. Forward Policy was the main factor in the raising. Levies were transitioned into Militia in 1900 on North Western Frontiers of Pakistan,. These Militias at Chitral, Khyber, Kurram, North Waziristan, and South Waziristan displayed an unpredictable behaviour during the Afghan War of 1919 and resultantly Khyber Rifles was disbanded, North and South Waziristan Militia were converted into Scouts. Only Chitral Scouts and Kurram Militia were predictable. North Waziristan Militia stands out among all Militia, only militia to be decorated with a Victoria Cross. The life pattern, organisation, and campaigns of this militia highlight the culture not only of militia but also of the area. This part put forward the hypothesis that the militia loyalty and rebellion was not due to the organisation or command factor but due to the culture of the area in which they were raised. The officers who served with these militias and served as political agents understood the cultural and politics of the tribes better than the staff officers. Militia in the end developed a unique culture quite different from regular army.

British Raj's campaign against Fakir of Ipi in North Waziristan 1936-1947, was the longest and the very first in modern time. Despite enjoying an overwhelming numerical, firepower and aerial superiority the military failed to apprehend Fakir of Ipi. Resultantly Ipi is regarded as a local hero and has attained a mystical figure among the tribes more specifically among natives of North Waziristan. The campaign was not due to Forward Policy or due to any international or economic reason, rather a love affair[56] initiated the campaign , which was prolonged by the structure of British administrative and military system. Militia was not trusted and neither they like the military. Fakir of Ipi despite being a naïve in military affairs was able to outsmart, out wit and achieved the notion of victory. The campaign thus when seen from present perspective, highlights the basic inherent flaw of military system. Level of violence varied, increasing with army taking political and operational control of agency and dropping when it handed over back to political agent and militia.

Part Three, 1947-2000. (chapter 6) Aim is to highlight the key role which Militia played in the immediate aftermath of independence. The Gilgit Rebellion by Gilgit Scouts and the liberation of Gilgit Baltistan was a strategic achievement; in line with objectives of Forward of Policy. in the absence of army, it was militia which kept the North Waziristan in a peaceful

[55] Raimund Popper *The Poverty of Historicism* .22-26

[56] In 1936 a Hindu girl of sixteen years of age Ram Kaur fell in love with a Muslim Wazir tribesman Syed Noor Ali Shah in Bannu, she embraced Islam, both got married, she adopted the name of Marjina, {Islam Bibi this name was given to her later)

environment without resorting to violence and firepower. In the same period the Russian invasion of Afghanistan took place, thus it was a culmination point of Forward Policy around which the militia and political agencies were created. The constitutional journey of the tribal areas has been highlighted. Policies have inertia and they do not die suddenly. Forward Policy was the scarlet thread of British actions on the north western frontier, the officers specifically the militia, military and political agents were engrossed into it. On partition in August 1947, British officials had the apprehensions about the India and its leaders of being pro-communist and anti-western, thus they devised a plan to ensure that frontier region should not be a part of India, there by cutting off all land routes between India and Russia. Gilgit Coup 'Operation Datta Khel' was carried out by Gilgit Scouts in winter of 1947. In post 1947, Pakistani officials were ignorant about the strategic implication of the forward policy and as such it was the British officials retained in Pakistan which formulated it. The events of 1978-1990 validates the Forward Policy. Tribal Areas as such were treated cautiously and with special handling under different constitutions of Pakistan. The internal situation in North Waziristan remained calm as compare to the past in the post partition era.

Part Four (2000-2012, Chapters 7,8,9) North Waziristan in the war on terror emerged as the most dangerous place and agency. The agency surprisingly remained peaceful till summer of 2005 and it erupted into violence only after army took over the operational control. Thus aim remains to find the exact cause of this deviation. Events reveal that before military takeover, the militia carried out operations which were more strategic in nature yet the violence was minimum. Militia knows and abide by the cultural values of the tribes where as army is not only ignorant of the cultural values due to its inherent organisational structure but also due to its character tends to over ride them through use of force. This cause resentment among the native tribes who since have a history of resorting to insurgency thus the violence spread. From 2006 onwards a strings of search operations were carried out, by Pakistan Army, Militia and at times Americans also, thus a repulsive attitude was adopted by the natives. American raid and later the Lal masjid were the two incidents that shaped the events in North Waziristan. Army lost its grip on the situation because it was beaten fair and square by the tribes at Hassu Khel and Jallar, resultantly its morale got low and it agreed to peace with the Taliban. The main emphasis in this part is to identify the precise incidents which ignites the violence. Inferences are drawn from the data and presented in the separate chapter . Maps, tables and figures have been given in the annexures.

Thus the organisation of research is in chronological manner, and in the end, the data itself reveals the findings (Solution Statement)

[1]Benedetto Croce,. *History,its Theory and Practice, t*rans. Douglas Ainslie .{NewYork:Russell,1960},p-12.

[2]FerdinandBraudel,. *On History* trans. Sarah Matthew . {University of Chicago,1980}.,p-64.